

Answer #259

We will take the three cases in order.

Case (a): The answer is (b): lower in frequency by a factor of two. Click your mouse on the photograph below to hear the answer. Note that in this case the wavelength is *exactly* twice as long.



Case (b): The answer is (a): one octave higher. Click your mouse on the photograph below to hear the answer. Well, *almost* one octave higher. The difference has to do with the difference in end correction for the two tubes. The actual loop length for the original tube is $L + 2e$, where L is the length of the tube and e is the end correction. For the shorter tube, the end correction is the same, so its loop length is $L/2 + 2e$. Note that the end correction for the shorter tube has a greater relative effect on the loop length

$$L + 2e < 2(L/2 + 2e) = L + 4e ,$$

making the wavelength of the shorter tube a bit longer than half that of the longer tube. So the frequency is a bit low - not quite an octave above the original longer tube. In fact, the frequency is about 6% low, one half-step in musical terms.



Case (c): The answer is (c): the same frequency. Click your mouse on the photograph below to hear the answer. Note that in this case, the length of the original (open) tube is $L + 2e$, and the length of the shorter tube is $L/2 + e$. Thus the loop lengths of the two tubes, respectively, are $L + 2e$ and $2(L/2 + e) = L + 2e$, exactly the same. However, because the shorter tube is a closed tube, it supports *only odd harmonics* while the longer tube supports *all harmonics*, so the shorter tube has a timbre that is a bit like that of a square wave.



Note that for case (a) above the loop lengths are in the ratio of *exactly* 2 to 1, including the end effect, so the frequencies are exactly a factor of two, or one octave, apart.

[Archive 13](#)

[Question of the Week](#)

[Outreach Index Page](#)

[Lecture-Demonstration Home Page](#)



For questions and comments regarding the *Question of the Week* contact [Dr. Richard E. Berg](#) by e-mail or using phone number or regular mail address given on the [Lecture-Demonstration Home Page](#).